

West Bengal - Reforms Calibrated Milestones & Scores

S.No	Reform Milestone	Max. Score	Achieved Score	
			Kolkata	Asansol
ULB LEVEL REFORMS				
1	e-Governance	10.0	8.75	6.3
2	Shift to Accrual based Double Entry Accounting	10.0	10.0	10.0
3	Property Tax (85% coverage & 90% collection efficiency)	10.0	6.5	5.5
4	100% O&M cost recovery in Water Supply & SWM	10.0	6.0	5.0
5	Internal Earmarking of Funds for Services to Urban Poor	10.0	10.0	10.0
6	Provision of Basic Services to Urban Poor	10.0	10.0	10.0
Total ULB Level Score		60.0	51.3	46.8
STATE LEVEL REFORMS				
1	Implementation of 74th CAA	15.0	14.0	14.0
2	Integration of City Planning & Delivery Functions	5.0	5.0	5.0
3	Reform in Rent Control	10.0	10.0	10.0
4	Stamp Duty Rationalization to 5%	10.0	5.0	5.0
5	Repeal of ULCRA	10.0	0.0	0.0
6	Enactment of Community Participation Law	10.0	10.0	10.0
7	Enactment of Public Disclosure Law	10.0	10.0	10.0
Total State Level Score		70.0	54.0	54.0
OPTIONAL REFORMS (State Level/ULB Level)				
1	Introduction of Property Title Certification System in ULBs	10.0	0.0	0.0
2	Revision of Building Bye laws – streamlining the Approval Process	10.0	10.0	10.0
3	Revision of Building Bye laws – To make rain water harvesting mandatory	10.0	10.0	10.0
4	Earmarking 25% developed land in all housing projects for EWS/LIG	10.0	10.0	10.0
5	Simplification of Legal and Procedural framework for conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes	10.0	10.0	10.0
6	Introduction of computerized process of Registration of land and Property	10.0	10.0	10.0
7	Byelaws on Reuse of Recycled Water	10.0	10.0	10.0
8	Administrative Reforms	10.0	10.0	10.0
9	Structural Reforms	10.0	10.0	10.0
10	Encouraging Public Private Participation	10.0	10.0	10.0
Total Optional Reforms Score		100.0	90.0	90.0

Total Score (23 Reforms)	230.0	195.3	190.8
% of Reforms Achievement		85%	83%

Calibrated Score			
ULB LEVEL REFORMS	60.0	51.3	46.8
STATE LEVEL REFORMS	70.0	54.0	54.0
OPTIONAL REFORMS (State Level/ULB Level)	100.0	90.0	90.0
	230.0	195.3	190.8

ULB LEVEL REFORMS	%	85%	78%
STATE LEVEL REFORMS	%	77%	77%
OPTIONAL REFORMS (State Level/ULB Level)	%	90%	90%
		85%	83%

Overall State Performance (Calibrated) 83.9%

West Bengal - Reforms Calibrated Milestones & Scores

Annexure

S.No	Reform Milestone	Calibrated Score	Kolkata	Asansol
			Y/N	Y/N
ULB LEVEL REFORMS				
1	e-Governance			
1	Property Tax	1.25	Y	N
2	Accounting	1.25	Y	Y
3	Water Supply & Other Utilities	1.25	Y	N
4	Birth & Death Registration and Health programmes	1.25	Y	Y
5	Citizens' Grievance Monitoring	1.25	Y	Y
6	Personnel Management System	1.25	Y	Y
7	Building Plan Approval	1.25	N	N
8	e-Procurement	1.25	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	8.75	6.25
2	Shift to Accrual based Double Entry Accounting			
1	Preparation of State Municipal Accounting Manual	1.5	Y	Y
2	Manual Approval & Adoption by the Local Body	1.5	Y	Y
3	Listing the Assets and Liabilities at ULB level	1.0	Y	Y
4	Valuation of Assets	1.0	Y	Y
5	Preparation of Opening Balance Sheet	1.0	Y	Y
6	Migration to DEAS	1.5	Y	Y
7	Appointment of Audit Officers/CA/Cadre	2.5	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.00	10.00
3	Property Tax			
1	Notification/Amendment of Act on Collection of Property Tax	1.0	Y	Y
2	Extending of property tax to all properties	1.0	Y	Y
3	Posting of tax details in the public domain & migration to standardized self-assessment system of property taxation on the basis of periodic revisions and review of rates	1.0	N	N
4	Setting up non-discretionary method for determination of property tax (unit area method or capital value method)	1.0	N	N
5	Coverage (85%)	3.0	3.0	2.0
6	Collection Efficiency (90%)	3.0	1.5	1.5
	Total	10.0	6.50	5.50
4	100% O&M cost recovery in Water Supply & SWM			
1	Formulate & Adopt a Policy on User Charges	1.0	Y	Y
2	Separate Accounting System for User Charges-Water Supply	0.5	Y	Y
3	Separate Accounting System for User Charges-SWM	0.5	Y	Y
4	Collection O&M Charges (WS)	4.0	4.0	3.0
5	Collection O&M Charges (SWM)	4.0	0.0	0.0
	Total	10.0	6.00	5.00
5	Internal Earmarking of Funds for Services to Urban Poor			
	Formulate & Adopt a Policy on earmarking of funds for urban poor	2.5	Y	Y
	Creation of separate Municipal budget for "Services to the Urban Poor"	2.5	Y	Y
	Targeted expenditure (20-25%)	2.5	Y	Y
	Actual spent as % of budgeted	2.5	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.00	10.00
6	Provision of Basic Services to Urban Poor			
1	Creation of database of Households	1.5	Y	Y
2	Whether municipal budget has provided any funds to achieve 7 point charter services listed below			
2a	Housing	1.0	Y	Y
2b	Water Supply	1.5	Y	Y
2c	Sanitation	1.5	Y	Y
2d	SWM	1.5	Y	Y
2e	Primary Education	1.0	Y	Y
2f	Healthcare	1.0	Y	Y
2g	Social Security	1.0	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.00	10.00
	Total ULB Level Score	60.0	51.25	46.75

West Bengal - Reforms Calibrated Milestones & Scores

Annexure

S.No	Reform Milestone	Calibrated Score	Kolkata	Asansol
			Y/N	Y/N
STATE LEVEL REFORMS				
1 Implementation of 74th CAA				
1	Constitution of Municipalities & Elections	2.0	Y	Y
2	Transfer of 12th Schedule functions (18 Functions) to ULBs*	9.0	8	8
3	Constitution of DPC	2.0	Y	Y
4	Constitution of MPC***	2.0	Y	Y
Total		15.0	14.00	14.00
		No. of Functions Transferred (*@0.5 score for transfer of each function)	16	16
2 Integration of City Planning & Delivery Functions				
1	Resolution to assign ULBs with City Planning Functions including Development Control Regulations & Building Byelaws	1.0	Y	Y
2	Preparation of CDP with inclusive and integrated planning	2.0	Y	Y
3	Placing of City Plans before MPC/ DPC	2.0	Y	Y
Total		5.0	5.00	5.00
3 Reform in Rent Control				
1	Availability of Rent Control Act	2.0	Y	Y
2	Provision of fixation of Standard Rent	2.0	Y	Y
3	Provision of revising rent periodically	2.0	Y	Y
4	Balancing obligations of Landlords and Tenants	2.0	Y	Y
5	Establish adjudication system for resolving disputes	2.0	Y	Y
Total		10.0	10.00	10.00
4 Stamp Duty Rationalization to 5%				
1	Reduce stamp duty to 5% (including surcharges)	5.0	N	N
2	Preparation of guidance values/Circle rates	2.5	Y	Y
3	Annual revision of guidance value	2.5	Y	Y
Total		10.0	5.00	5.00
5 Repeal of ULCRA				
1	State legislature to pass a resolution in compliance with the repeal of ULCRA passed by Parliament in 1999	7.0	N	N
2	State government to issue notification in this regard	3.0	N	N
Total		10.0	0.00	0.00
6 Enactment of Community Participation Law				
1	Notification of Legislation for ensuring community participation	2.5	Y	Y
2	Constitution of Ward Committees	2.5	Y	Y
3	Citizen Charter with timelines	2.5	Y	Y
4	Any additional provision/instrument for citizen participation	2.5	Y	Y
Total		10.0	10.00	10.00
7 Enactment of Public Disclosure Law				
1	Legislation of RTI Act	2.5	Y	Y
2	Implementation of RTI Act	2.5	Y	Y
3	Preparation of Citizen Charter	2.5	Y	Y
4	Disclose through a website	2.5	Y	Y
Total		10.0	10.00	10.00
Total State Level Score		70.0	54.00	54.00
OPTIONAL REFORMS (State Level/ULB Level)				
1 Introduction of Property Title Certification System in ULBs				
1	Arrangement for reflecting property titles in a legal framework	2.5	N	N
2	Arrangement for adjudication for property title dispute	2.5	N	N
3	Notification of rules for smooth implementation	2.5	N	N
4	Setting up administrative system/process	2.5	N	N
Total		10.0	0.0	0.0
2 Revision of Building Bye laws – streamlining the Approval Process				
1	Notification of building byelaws in public domain	5.0	Y	Y
2	Establish adjudication system for resolving disputes	2.5	Y	Y
3	Time frame for approval process	2.5	Y	Y
Total		10.0	10.0	10.0

West Bengal - Reforms Calibrated Milestones & Scores

Annexure

S.No	Reform Milestone	Calibrated Score	Kolkata	Asansol
			Y/N	Y/N
3	Revision of Building Bye laws – To make rain water harvesting mandatory			
1	Building Byelaws to mandatorily provide for Rainwater Harvesting	5.0	Y	Y
2	Dissemination of such Byelaws through website	2.0	Y	Y
3	Start of approval as per the new Building Byelaws	3.0	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.0	10.0
4	Earmarking 25% developed land in all housing projects for EWS/LIG			
1	Notify the reservation of land between 20 and 25% in housing projects (Public/Private)	5.0	Y	Y
2	Review and revise Building Bye Laws to reflect to earmarked land to EWS/LIG	2.5	Y	Y
3	Engaging with state departments for implementing EDL (Earmarking Developed Land)	2.5	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.0	10.0
5	Simplification of Legal and Procedural framework for conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes			
1	Availability of legal framework for conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes	5.0	Y	Y
2	Notification of rules and processes	2.5	Y	Y
3	Establish adjudication system for resolving disputes	2.5	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.0	10.0
6	Introduction of computerized process of Registration of land and Property			
1	Computerized registration of land and properties	5.0	Y	Y
2	Capturing of photo of seller & buyer	2.0	Y	Y
3	Creation of database system	3.0	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.0	10.0
7	Byelaws on Reuse of Recycled Water			
1	Building Byelaws to mandatorily reflect reuse of recycled water	8.0	Y	Y
2	Dissemination of new building byelaws through websites	2.0	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.0	10.0
8	Administrative Reforms			
1	Rules notified for Personnel Management Systems in Local Bodies.	2.0	Y	Y
2	Grievance management system	2.0	Y	Y
3	Computerization of Administrative activities	2.0	Y	Y
4	Training and skill building initiatives	2.0	Y	Y
5	Encourage Outsourcing of Municipal Activities	2.0	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.0	10.0
9	Structural Reforms			
1	Creation of municipal cadre	5.0	Y	Y
2	Standing committee for municipal subject matters (Engg., Accounts, Health, Welfare etc.)	2.5	Y	Y
3	Involvement of elected representatives in decision making process	1.5	Y	Y
4	Dispute resolution mechanism	1.0	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10	10
10	Encouraging Public Private Participation			
1	Project initiatives planned through PPP	6.0	Y	Y
2	Setting up of PPP cell at State level	2.0	Y	Y
3	Formulation of PPP policies and governance framework	2.0	Y	Y
	Total	10.0	10.0	10.0
	Total Optional Reforms Score	100.0	90.0	90.0
	Total Score (23 Reforms)	230.0	195.3	190.8

Property Tax : *Coverage: 25%- 50%: 1, Above 50% to less than 85%: 2, 85% and Above:3, **Collection: 25%- 50%: 1, Above 50% to less than 75%: 1.5, Above 75% to less than 90%: 2.5, 90% and Above:3

WS & SWM: *Collection of user charges will be considered as part of Property tax if accounted under a separate head of account. **Score** : 15 to 25% :1, 25 to 50% :2, Above 50% to 75%: 3, Above 75% to less than 100%:3.5, 100% and Above: 4

74th CAA :***States exempted under 6th Schedule of Constitution will be considered as having achieved this module. Also, in States having no region eligible to be declared as Metropolitan Region, these 2 marks will be assigned pro-rata to their items.