

## Gujarat - Reforms Calibrated Milestones &amp; Scores

S.No	Reform Milestone	Max. Score	Achieved Score				
			Ahmedabad	Surat	Vadodara	Rajkot	Porbandar
<b>ULB LEVEL REFORMS</b>							
1	e-Governance	10.0	10.00	10.00	8.75	10.00	6.25
2	Shift to Accrual based Double Entry Accounting	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	9.0	7.0
3	Property Tax (85% coverage & 90% collection efficiency)	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	9.5
4	100% O&M cost recovery in Water Supply & SWM	10.0	9.0	10.0	7.5	7.5	6.0
5	Internal Earmarking of Funds for Services to Urban Poor	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	5.0
6	Provision of Basic Services to Urban Poor	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	8.5
<b>Total ULB Level Score</b>		<b>60.0</b>	<b>59.0</b>	<b>60.0</b>	<b>56.3</b>	<b>56.5</b>	<b>42.3</b>
<b>STATE LEVEL REFORMS</b>							
1	Implementation of 74th CAA	15.0	13.0	13.0	13.0	13.0	13.0
2	Integration of City Planning & Delivery Functions	5.0	5.0	5.0	5.0	5.0	5.0
3	Reform in Rent Control	10.0	4.0	4.0	4.0	4.0	4.0
4	Stamp Duty Rationalization to 5%	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
5	Repeal of ULCRA	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
6	Enactment of Community Participation Law	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
7	Enactment of Public Disclosure Law	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
<b>Total State Level Score</b>		<b>70.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>
<b>OPTIONAL REFORMS (State Level/ULB Level)</b>							
1	Introduction of Property Title Certification System in ULBs	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
2	Revision of Building Bye laws – streamlining the Approval Process	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	2.5
3	Revision of Building Bye laws – To make rain water harvesting mandatory	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	8.0
4	Earmarking 25% developed land in all housing projects for EWS/LIG	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	5.0
5	Simplification of Legal and Procedural framework for conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
6	Introduction of computerized process of Registration of land and Property	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
7	Byelaws on Reuse of Recycled Water	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	0.0
8	Administrative Reforms	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	8.0
9	Structural Reforms	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
10	Encouraging Public Private Participation	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0
<b>Total Optional Reforms Score</b>		<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>73.5</b>
<b>Total Score (23 Reforms)</b>		<b>230.0</b>	<b>221.0</b>	<b>222.0</b>	<b>218.3</b>	<b>218.5</b>	<b>177.8</b>
<b>% of Reforms Achievement</b>			96%	97%	95%	95%	77%

<b>ULB Level Reforms</b>	<b>60.0</b>	59.0	60.0	56.3	56.5	42.3
<b>State Level Reforms</b>	<b>70.0</b>	62.0	62.0	62.0	62.0	62.0
<b>Optional Reforms</b>	<b>100.0</b>	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	73.5
	<b>230.0</b>	<b>221.0</b>	<b>222.0</b>	<b>218.3</b>	<b>218.5</b>	<b>177.8</b>
	%					
<b>ULB Level Reforms</b>		98%	100%	94%	94%	70%
<b>State Level Reforms</b>		89%	89%	89%	89%	89%
<b>Optional Reforms</b>		100%	100%	100%	100%	74%
		<b>96%</b>	<b>97%</b>	<b>95%</b>	<b>95%</b>	<b>77%</b>

Overall State Performance (Calibrated) **92.0%**

## Gujarat - Reforms Calibrated Milestones &amp; Scores

S.No	Reform Milestone	Calibrated Score	Ahmedabad	Surat	Vadodara	Rajkot	Porbandar
			Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N
<b>ULB LEVEL REFORMS</b>							
<b>1</b>	<b>e-Governance</b>						
1	Property Tax	1.25	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Accounting	1.25	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Water Supply & Other Utilities	1.25	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Birth & Death Registration and Health programmes	1.25	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Citizens' Grievance Monitoring	1.25	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
6	Personnel Management System	1.25	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
7	Building Plan Approval	1.25	Y	Y	N	Y	N
8	e-Procurement	1.25	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>8.75</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>6.25</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Shift to Accrual based Double Entry Accounting</b>						
1	Preparation of State Municipal Accounting Manual	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
2	Manual Approval & Adoption by the Local Body	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
3	Listing the Assets and Liabilities at ULB level	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Valuation of Assets	1.0	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
5	Preparation of Opening Balance Sheet	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
6	Migration to DEAS	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
7	Appointment of Audit Officers/CA/Cadre	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>9.0</b>	<b>7.0</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Property Tax (85% coverage)</b>						
1	Notification/Amendment of Act on Collection of Property Tax	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Extending of property tax to all properties	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Posting of tax details in the public domain & migration to standardized self-assessment system of property taxation on the basis of periodic revisions and review of rates	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Setting up non-discretionary method for determination of property tax (unit area method or capital value method)	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Coverage (85%)	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0
6	Collection Efficiency (90%)	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	2.5
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>9.50</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>100% O&amp;M cost recovery in Water Supply &amp; SWM</b>						
1	Formulate & Adopt a Policy on User Charges	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Separate Accounting System for User Charges-Water Supply	0.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Separate Accounting System for User Charges-SWM	0.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Collection O&M Charges (WS)	4.0	3.5	4.0	3.5	3.5	3.0
5	Collection O&M Charges (SWM)	4.0	3.5	4.0	2.0	2.0	1.0
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>9.00</b>	<b>10.00</b>	<b>7.50</b>	<b>7.50</b>	<b>6.00</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Internal Earmarking of Funds for Services to Urban Poor</b>						
	Formulate & Adopt a Policy on earmarking of funds for urban poor	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Creation of separate Municipal budget for "Services to the Urban Poor"	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
	Targeted expenditure (20-25%)	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Actual spent as % of budgeted	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>Provision of Basic Services to Urban Poor</b>						
1	Creation of database of Households	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Whether municipal budget has provided any funds to achieve 7 point charter services listed below						
2a	Housing	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2b	Water Supply	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2c	Sanitation	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2d	SWM	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
2e	Primary Education	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2f	Healthcare	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2g	Social Security	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>8.5</b>
	<b>Total ULB Level Score</b>	<b>60.0</b>	<b>59.0</b>	<b>60.0</b>	<b>56.3</b>	<b>56.5</b>	<b>42.3</b>
<b>STATE LEVEL REFORMS</b>							
<b>1</b>	<b>Implementation of 74th CAA</b>						
1	Constitution of Municipalities & Elections	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Transfer of 12th Schedule functions (18 Functions) to ULBs*	9.0	9	9	9	9	9
3	Constitution of DPC**	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Constitution of MPC**	2.0	N	N	N	N	N
	<b>Total</b>	<b>15.0</b>	<b>13.00</b>	<b>13.00</b>	<b>13.00</b>	<b>13.00</b>	<b>13.00</b>
	No. of Functions Transferred (*@0.5 score for transfer of each function)		18	18	18	18	18
<b>2</b>	<b>Integration of City Planning &amp; Delivery Functions</b>						
1	Resolution to assign ULBs with City Planning Functions including Development Control Regulations & Building Byelaws	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Preparation of CDP with inclusive and integrated planning	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Placing of City Plans before MPC/ DPC	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>5.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Reform in Rent Control</b>						
1	Availability of Rent Control Act	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Provision of fixation of Standard Rent	2.0	N	N	N	N	N

### Gujarat - Reforms Calibrated Milestones & Scores

S.No	Reform Milestone	Calibrated Score	Ahmedabad	Surat	Vadodara	Rajkot	Porbandar
			Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N
3	Provision of revising rent periodically	2.0	N	N	N	N	N
4	Balancing obligations of Landlords and Tenants	2.0	N	N	N	N	N
5	Establish adjudication system for resolving disputes	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>4.0</b>	<b>4.0</b>	<b>4.0</b>	<b>4.0</b>	<b>4.0</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>Stamp Duty Rationalization to 5%#</b>						
1	Reduce stamp duty to 5% (including surcharges)	5.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Preparation of guidance values/Circle rates	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Annual revision of guidance value	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Repeal of ULCRA</b>						
1	State legislature to pass a resolution in compliance with the repeal of ULCRA passed by Parliament in 1999	7.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	State government to issue notification in this regard	3.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>Enactment of Community Participation Law</b>						
1	Notification of Legislation for ensuring community participation	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Constitution of Ward Committees	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Citizen Charter with timelines	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Any additional provision/instrument for citizen participation	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>Enactment of Public Disclosure Law</b>						
1	Legislation of RTI Act	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Implementation of RTI Act	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Preparation of Citizen Charter	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Disclose through a website	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>
	<b>Total State Level Score</b>	<b>70.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>	<b>62.0</b>
	<b>OPTIONAL REFORMS (State Level/ULB Level)</b>						
<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction of Property Title Certification System in ULBs</b>						
1	Arrangement for reflecting property titles in a legal framework	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Arrangement for adjudication for property title dispute	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Notification of rules for smooth implementation	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Setting up administrative system/process	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Revision of Building Bye laws – streamlining the Approval Process</b>						
1	Notification of building byelaws in public domain	5.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
2	Establish adjudication system for resolving disputes	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Time frame for approval process	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>2.5</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Revision of Building Bye laws – To make rain water harvesting mandatory</b>						
1	Building Byelaws to mandatorily provide for Rainwater Harvesting	5.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Dissemination of such Byelaws through website	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
3	Start of approval as per the new Building Byelaws	3.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>8.0</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>Earmarking 25% developed land in all housing projects for EWS/LIG</b>						
1	Notify the reservation of land between 20 and 25% in housing projects (Public/Private)	5.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Review and revise Building Bye Laws to reflect to earmarked land to EWS/LIG	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
3	Engaging with state departments for implementing EDL (Earmarking Developed Land)	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Simplification of Legal and Procedural framework for conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes</b>						
1	Availability of legal framework for conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes	5.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Notification of rules and processes	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Establish adjudication system for resolving disputes	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>Introduction of computerized process of Registration of land and Property</b>						
1	Computerized registration of land and properties	5.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Capturing of photo of seller & buyer	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Creation of database system	3.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>Byelaws on Reuse of Recycled Water</b>						
1	Building Byelaws to mandatorily reflect reuse of recycled water	8.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
2	Dissemination of new building byelaws through websites	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>0.0</b>
<b>8</b>	<b>Administrative Reforms</b>						
1	Rules notified for Personnel Management Systems in Local Bodies.	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Grievance management system	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Computerization of Administrative activities	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
4	Training and skill building initiatives	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5	Encourage Outsourcing of Municipal Activities	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>8.0</b>
<b>9</b>	<b>Structural Reforms</b>						

### Gujarat - Reforms Calibrated Milestones & Scores

S.No	Reform Milestone	Calibrated Score	Ahmedabad	Surat	Vadodara	Rajkot	Porbandar
			Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N
1	Creation of municipal cadre	5.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Standing committee for municipal subject matters (Engg., Accounts, Health, Welfare etc.)	2.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Involvement of elected representatives in decision making process	1.5	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
4	Dispute resolution mechanism	1.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>10</b>	<b>Encouraging Public Private Participation</b>						
1	Project initiatives planned through PPP	6.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
2	Setting up of PPP cell at State level	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3	Formulation of PPP policies and governance framework	2.0	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>	<b>10.0</b>
	<b>Total Optional Reforms Score</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>100.0</b>	<b>73.5</b>
	<b>Total Score (23 Reforms)</b>	<b>230.0</b>	<b>221.0</b>	<b>222.0</b>	<b>218.3</b>	<b>218.5</b>	<b>177.8</b>

**Property Tax:** \*Coverage: 25%- 50%: 1, Above 50% to less than 85%: 2, 85% and Above:3. \*\*Collection: 25%- 50%: 1, Above 50% to less than 75%: 1.5, Above 75% to less than 90%: 2.5, 90% and Above:3

**WS & SWM:** \*Collection of user charges will be considered as part of Property tax if accounted under a separate head of account. **Score** : 15 to 25% :1, 25 to 50% :2, Above 50% to 75%: 3, Above 75% to less than 100%:3.5, 100% and Above: 4

**74th CAA:** \*\*\*States exempted under 6th Schedule of Constitution will be considered as having achieved this module. Also, in States having no region eligible to be declared as Metropolitan Region, these 2 marks will be assigned pro-rata to their items.

**Stamp Duty:**# Rate of 6% would be acceptable if 4% is provided for cases where property is registered solely in the name of women