

JN-NURM CDP Appraisal Report – AGRA

1) Eligibility and Category

The city of Agra is an eligible city for funding under the JNNURM. Agra comes under the Category B (million plus population).

2) Willingness to Undertake Mandatory Reforms

The CDP addresses the issue of reforms to be undertaken at two places in the report, in Chapter 10 and in Chapter 14. In Chapter 10, the current status has been detailed out while in Chapter 14, the future scenario has been envisaged. It has also been mentioned at page 14-5 to 14-7 that the UP Government as well as Agra Nagar Nigam and other agencies are willing to undertake the reforms envisaged under JNNURM.

Discussions with Sh. Anil Kumar Sagar, IAS, Director, Local Bodies, UP and Prof. Nishith Rai, Director, RCUES have also revealed the keen interest being evinced by the Govt. of UP in seriously undertaking the JN NURM.

3) Consultations and Ownership of the CDP

Chapter 12 discusses the issue of consultation in detail. The consultations have been undertaken with a large number of stakeholders; both primary and secondary. This chapter comprising of 11 pages clearly describes the manner in which the CDP was evolved through a consultative process.

It is heartening to see that in addition to the Government and parastatal stakeholders, a good number private parties, NGOs, Citizen's Council, trade associations , etc. have also been included in the consultations. Representatives from the *Petha* industry, leather industry and foundry industry were also consulted. Local handicraft workers were also consulted. Annexure 12 gives a long list of stakeholders consulted.

The consultants have also had consultations with the Supreme Court representative as indicated on page 12-6. The chapter has been well illustrated with photographs and it is evident that the vision has been developed through the process of due deliberations as is revealed from section 12.3.3. on Workshops on Formulation of City Vision, section 12.3.4 on Workshop for Project Identification and section 12.3.5 on Finalisation of Draft Report. Therefore, the CDP appears to have the ownership and approval of the local population.

4) Project Identification and Prioritisation

A detailed account of the project identification and prioritization through the consultative process is given in Chapter 12 as well as Chapter 15. Further, a Priority Matrix has also been given at section 12.4. It can be seen that the views of the local people have been taken into account while selecting the projects, thereby indicating a down-top approach.

Tables 12.1,12.2 and 12.3 clearly indicate the priorities of the local people. The environment angle also appears to have been taken into account since Agra is an environmentally sensitive area. Priority levels have been classified as high, medium or low and accordingly, the projects have been worked out.

5) Project Structuring

Project identification has been done in a systematic manner as indicated in Chapter 15 wherein existing deficiencies and future shortfall / requirements have been clearly identified and then the projects have been proposed. The project structuring in terms of breakup between various sectors, various agencies and the two submissions has been done clearly. Phasing has also been indicated over the entire period of JN NURM.

In fact, even before structuring the projects, in each sector, the vision has been worked out for the year 2021 , in stages of upto year 2011, 2016 and 2021. This has been diagrammaticall indicated in Chapter 13 very clearly. From this , one can see clearly what is the overall projected growth path and to what extent the JNNURM can contribute in this phase.

The costing and investment plan is in order and clearly indicates the manner in which the costs have been arrived. Tables 15.2 to 15.10 indicate the methodology of arriving at the requirements, taking into the present shortfall/requirement, future requirement and then

working the total requirement. Escalation has been taken into account.

Capacity building for governance and reform has also been included. The financing strategy has been clearly given at section 16.2. Fig. 16.1 clearly indicates project structuring. The financing strategy has been clearly indicated for each and every project. It can be concluded that the project structuring has been satisfactory.

The CDP clearly gives the financials; year wise, organisation wise, sector wise and project wise. From this, the picture becomes very clear for each organisation, sector and project. Tables 16.4 to 16.15 give the clear picture for every project that has been envisaged.

6) Private Sector Participation

The CDP recognises the importance of private sector and envisions private sector participation where ever it is possible. In fact, specific areas have been identified. Section 16.4 clearly indicates that 17.04 percent of the total investment would come from the private sector. The areas indicated for private sector participation appear to be viable.

7) E-Governance

Section 10.6 of the CDP discusses the status of municipal e-Governance in the city of Agra. e-Governance at present is in the initial stages. The report indicates the efforts of the Agra Nagar Nigam towards e-governance under the head of Capacity Building. A total amount of Rs.10 crores has been earmarked for the same which includes e-governance, amongst several other items.

8) Urban Poor and Slums

The issue of urban poor and slums has been well addressed in Chapter 8 and subsequently in Chapters 12, 13, 14 and 15. The issue of security of tenure has been included in page 15-7 as well as in page 15-14 in Table 15.20. The CDP also recognizes the importance of basic services and employment generation.

9) Sustainability

It can be seen that while the contribution of the Central Government would be 50 percent and that of the Government of UP would be 20 percent, the remaining 30 percent has been structured in such a manner that all the para-statal agencies, in addition to the Agra Nagar

Nigam would contribute. Therefore, the actual contribution of the ANN stands at a nominal 0.07 percent.

Further, with the governance and other reforms and capacity building and enforcing tax coverage and collection discipline, the future maintenance and sustainability of the projects could be ensured. To implement and sustain large investments, organisational and governance capacities are the key.

At section 10.5, the CDP clearly brings out the areas of fragmentation and functional overlap, status of municipal e-governance, status of implementation of 74th CAA, status of reforms undertaken, impact of current situation on service delivery , role of private sector potential for PPP and existing organisational and governance problems. Further, in Chapter 14, the new governance framework in which various stakeholders need to play a more proactive role has also been indicated along with the reform agenda for better governance.

An analysis of the various tables on financials reveals that the proposals are practical and viable.

10) Overall Quality of Content of Report

The CDP takes a comprehensive view of the city of Agra and projects a vision of an international tourist destination. The city vision reads , "*full utilisation of Agra's potential for improving the economy of the city by providing equal access to best quality physical and social infrastructure to all residents and tourists*".

The concerns of Agra as an international tourist destination, provision of adequate infrastructure facilities, urban renewal of inner city, intensification of economic regeneration , taking care of slums and the urban poor have been addressed. The overall vision and sectoral strategies have been well articulated.

The overall quality and contents of the report are good. The report has been professionally prepared in a detailed, scientific and methodical manner and is very clear and comprehensive. The data analysis is adequate.

11) Adherence to JN NURM Toolkit

The report is in conformance to the JN NURM guidelines.

12) Recommendation

The CDP Agra is a well developed document, incorporating local and statutory requirements. The report is well written and colorfully presented, making the comprehension easy. The city development vision has been well articulated. The stakeholders, local residents and the consultants have done a commendable job.

The report is acceptable and the next stage of DPR preparation may be initiated.

5th September 2006

(Prof. Dr. P.S.N.Rao)
Professor of Urban Management
IIPA, New Delhi

05th September, 2006

Dear Shri Rajamani,

**Sub : Consultancy Project : CDP Appraisal Report - AGRA
Under JN NURM**

We are happy to enclose our Appraisal Report on the CDP for AGRA for necessary action at your end.

Assuring you of quality and timely services at all times,

Yours sincerely,

(P.L.Sanjeev Reddy)

Encl : a/a

**Shri M Rajamani, IAS
Joint Secretary and Mission Director, JN NURM
Ministry of Urban Development
Government of India
Nirman Bhawan
New Delhi**